

# Module 13: Multiple Membership Multilevel Models

## Stata Practical

*George Leckie*  
Centre for Multilevel Modelling

### Pre-requisites

- Modules 1-5,11,12

## Contents

<b>Introduction to the Patient Satisfaction Dataset .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>P13.1 Examining and Describing the Data.....</b>	<b>6</b>
P13.1.1 Exploring the multiple membership data structure.....	8
P13.1.2 Summarising the response and predictor variables .....	13
<b>P13.2 A Multiple Membership Model of Satisfaction .....</b>	<b>16</b>
P13.2.1 Specifying and fitting the multiple membership model.....	16
P13.2.2 Interpretation of the model output .....	20
P13.2.3 Calculating coverage intervals, variance partition coefficients (VPCs) and intraclass correlation coefficients (ICCs).....	22
P13.2.4 Predicting and examining nurse effects .....	26
<b>P13.3 Exploring Alternative Multiple Membership Weighting Schemes .....</b>	<b>32</b>
<b>P13.4 Adding Predictor Variables.....</b>	<b>37</b>
P13.4.1 Adding patient level predictor variables .....	37
P13.4.2 Adding nurse level predictor variables .....	39
<b>P13.5 Adding Random Coefficients.....</b>	<b>42</b>
P13.5.1 Adding cross-level interactions .....	43
<b>Further Reading.....</b>	<b>44</b>
<b>References .....</b>	<b>45</b>

If you find this module helpful and wish to cite it in your research, please use the following citation:

Leckie, G. (2013). Multiple Membership Multilevel Models - Stata Practical. LEMMA VLE Module 13, 1-45.  
<http://www.bristol.ac.uk/cmm/learning/course.html>

Address for correspondence:

George Leckie  
Centre for Multilevel Modelling  
University of Bristol  
2 Priory Road  
Bristol, BS8 1TX  
UK

[g.leckie@bristol.ac.uk](mailto:g.leckie@bristol.ac.uk)

## Introduction to the Patient Satisfaction Dataset

We will analyse simulated data based on a fictitious patient survey carried out in a local hospital. In this fictitious survey, hip replacement patients were asked to score how satisfied they were with the level of care provided to them by hospital nurses during their recent hospital stay. We expect nurses to play an important role in the scores patients give with patients reporting more favourably when cared for by certain nurses. Ultimately, the hospital wants to learn what it is about these nurses which results in patients reporting better hospital experiences. Armed with such knowledge, the hospital would then like to implement additional training for all nurses with the ultimate goal of improving all patients' hospital experiences.

During the course of their hospital stays, most patients were cared for by multiple nurses and so the data are more complex than a simple two-level hierarchy of patients nested within nurses. Rather the data are characterised by a non-hierarchical multiple membership structure whereby patients (level 1) are multiple members of nurses (level 2).

The simulated data consist of 1,000 patients who, between them, were cared for by 25 nurses. Four hundred patients were cared for by only one nurse during their stay, 300 patients were cared for by two nurses, 200 patients by three nurses, and 100 patients by four nurses. The data record which nurses cared for which patients.

The response variable is a continuous measure of patients' overall satisfaction with the care they received during their hospital stay. The data also record a continuous measure of patients' likelihood of having a successful operation calculated at a preoperative assessment clinic. The score is based on patients' current medical fitness, their medical history and any other factors that might lead to complications with their operation. Both scores are standardised to have zero means and variances of one.

The multilevel modelling routines in different software packages require data describing the multiple membership structure (i.e. the nurse identifiers and the proportion of time each patient is cared for by each nurse) to be stored in one of two different forms: *compact* form or *wide* form.<sup>1</sup> Both forms have one row per patient, but store the multiple membership information using different sets of variables. In this dataset, we store these data twice, once in each form so that we can contrast the two approaches.

Compact form consists of two sets of variables: the multiple membership ID variables **n1st** to **n4th** which record the first, second, third and fourth nurse that cared for each patient and the associated multiple membership weight variables **p1st** to **p4th** which record the proportion of time cared for by each of these

---

<sup>1</sup> For example, the multilevel modelling classical estimation routines in MLwiN require these data to be in wide form, while the Bayesian routines in MLwiN only accept these data in compact form. The multilevel modelling routines in Stata and R only accept the multiple membership information in wide form.

nurses.<sup>2</sup> Wide form carries the same information in one set of variables, **p1** to **p25**, which records the proportion of time each patient is cared for by each of the 25 nurses.<sup>3</sup> For example, **p1** reports the proportion of time cared for by nurse 1, **p2** the proportion of time cared for by nurse 2, and so on, up until **p25**, the proportion of time cared for by nurse 25, the final nurse.

The data contain a single nurse level variable, a measure of how happy nurses feel about their jobs. This nurse level variable is also stored in the dataset in both compact (**h1st**, **h2nd**, **h3rd** and **h4th**) and wide (**h1** to **h25**) forms.

---

<sup>2</sup> Had the maximum number of nurses seen by any patient been five rather than four, then there would have been five multiple membership ID variables and five associated multiple membership weight variables rather than four.

<sup>3</sup> In this example wide form is a less efficient means of storage than compact form as it takes 25 variables to store the multiple membership information compared to eight variables for compact form.

The dataset contains the following variables

Variable name	Description and codes
patient	Patient ID
satis	Patient postoperative satisfaction score. Scores are (approximately) standardised to have a mean of zero and a variance of one, with a higher score indicating a more satisfied patient.
assess	Patient preoperative assessment score. Scores are standardised to have a mean of zero and a variance of one, with a higher score indicating a patient that was assessed to be more likely to have a successful operation.
nurses	Number of nurses seen by patient
n1st	Nurse ID for patient's 1st nurse
n2nd	Nurse ID for patient's 2nd nurse
n3rd	Nurse ID for patient's 3rd nurse
n4th	Nurse ID for patient's 4th nurse
p1st	Prop. time cared for by 1st nurse
p2nd	Prop. time cared for by 2nd nurse
p3rd	Prop. time cared for by 3rd nurse
p4th	Prop. time cared for by 4th nurse
h1st	Happiness score for 1st nurse
h2nd	Happiness score for 2nd nurse
h3rd	Happiness score for 3rd nurse
h4th	Happiness score for 4th nurse
p1	Prop. time cared for by nurse 1
p2	Prop. time cared for by nurse 2
:	:
p25	Prop. time cared for by nurse 25
h1	Happiness score for nurse 1
h2	Happiness score for nurse 2
:	:
h25	Happiness score for nurse 25

## P13.1 Examining and Describing the Data

Load '13.1.dta' into memory and open the do-file for this lesson

From within the LEMMA learning environment

- Go to **Module 13: Multiple Membership Multilevel Models**, and scroll down to **Stata files**
- Click **'13.1.dta'** to open the dataset

and use the `describe` command to produce a summary of the dataset

```
. describe

Contains data from 13.1.dta
  obs:      1,000
  vars:      66                25 Jul 2012 14:43
  size:     247,000
-----
```

variable name	storage type	display format	value label	variable label
patient	int	%9.0g		Patient ID
satis	float	%3.2f		Satisfaction Score
assess	float	%9.0g		Assessment Score
nurses	byte	%9.0g		Number of nurses seen by patient
n1st	byte	%9.0g		Nurse ID for patient's 1st nurse
n2nd	byte	%9.0g		Nurse ID for patient's 2nd nurse
n3rd	byte	%9.0g		Nurse ID for patient's 3rd nurse
n4th	byte	%9.0g		Nurse ID for patient's 4th nurse
p1st	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by 1st nurse
p2nd	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by 2nd nurse
p3rd	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by 3rd nurse
p4th	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by 4th nurse
h1st	float	%3.2f		Happiness score for 1st nurse
h2nd	float	%3.2f		Happiness score for 2nd nurse
h3rd	float	%3.2f		Happiness score for 3rd nurse
h4th	float	%3.2f		Happiness score for 4th nurse
p1	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 1
p2	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 2
p3	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 3
p4	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 4
p5	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 5
p6	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 6
p7	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 7
p8	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 8
p9	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 9
p10	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 10
p11	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 11
p12	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 12
p13	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 13
p14	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 14
p15	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 15
p16	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 16
p17	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 17
p18	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 18
p19	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 19
p20	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 20
p21	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 21
p22	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 22
p23	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 23
p24	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 24
p25	float	%9.0g		Prop. time cared for by nurse 25
h1	float	%3.2f		Happiness score for nurse 1

This document is only the first few pages of the full version.

To see the complete document please go to learning materials and register:  
<http://www.cmm.bris.ac.uk/lemma>

**The course is completely free.** We ask for a few details about yourself for our research purposes only. We will not give any details to any other organisation unless it is with your express permission.